TO: ALA/ALCTS/CaMMS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access  
FROM: Glenn Patton, OCLC Ex-officio Member  
SUBJECT: Revision of RDA 2.5.1.4, Recording Edition Statements

Background

OCLC member libraries, especially those who catalog government reports and other publications, frequently ask how to distinguish versions of a resource issued with the same title and in the same year but without an explicit edition statement. OCLC staff members have depended on AACR2 rule 1.2B4 (and the related Library of Congress Rule Interpretation) to provide guidance to member libraries in supplying an edition statement to distinguish between such versions of a resource. Having a supplied edition statement clarifies for end-users what might otherwise appear to be duplicate records. It also frequently is an essential factor in preventing incorrect matches in record loading processes and inappropriate record merges in automated duplicate processing.

RDA lacks an instruction that is parallel to AACR2 rule 1.2B4 (and to ISBD Consolidated Edition 2.1.3). The Library of Congress has created a Policy Statement that covers the essence of the AACR2 rule but recent comments in the ALCTS RDA webinars and in the discussions about PCC RDA policies (as well as OCLC’s own internal RDA implementation discussions) point toward the desirability of adding an instruction to RDA itself. Adding the instruction would also benefit users of RDA that may not routinely use the LC Policy Statements as part of their cataloging policies.

OCLC is therefore proposing the following revision to add an Optional Addition instruction to the existing text of RDA 2.5.1.4.

Proposed revision:

2.5.1.4 Recording Edition Statements

Transcribe an edition statement as it appears on the source of information. Apply the general guidelines on transcription given under 1.7.

[examples omitted; no change]

Optional Addition

Supply an edition statement in the language and script of the title proper if the resource lacks one but is known to contain significant changes from other editions, if it is considered necessary for identification. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.
2.5.1.4 Recording Edition Statements

Transcribe an edition statement as it appears on the source of information. Apply the general guidelines on transcription given under 1.7.

[examples omitted; no change]

Optional Addition

Supply an edition statement in the language and script of the title proper if the resource lacks one but is known to contain significant changes from other editions, if it is considered necessary for identification. Indicate that the information was taken from a source outside the resource itself as instructed under 2.2.4.

Appendix: Texts for Comparison

AACR2R 1.2B4

1.2B4. Optional addition. If an item lacks an edition statement but is known to contain significant changes from other editions, supply a suitable brief statement in the language and script of the title proper and enclose it in square brackets.

[New ed.]
[3rd ed.]
[2nd ed., partly rev.]

Library of Congress Rule Interpretation for AACR2R 1.2B4

LC practice: Do not apply this optional rule to any case of merely supposed differences in issues that might make them different editions. Apply the option for manifest differences where the catalog records would otherwise show exactly the same information in the areas beginning with the title and statement of responsibility area and ending with the series area.

LC/PCC practice for updating loose-leaves: Apply the option if the main entry and/or title proper of a resource being cataloged would be the same as that of the resource it continues.

Library of Congress Policy Statement for RDA 2.5.1.4

If a resource lacks an edition statement but it is known to contain significant changes from other editions, supply a brief statement in the language and script of the title proper and enclose it in square brackets.

2.1.3 When no edition statement appears on the resource, although it is known that the resource contains significant changes from previous editions or is a reproduction, a suitable edition statement in the language of the preferred source of information and in accordance with the provisions of 2.1.2 may be supplied, enclosed in square brackets. Edition numbers should not be supplied, unless it is clear that the resource has a place in a sequence of otherwise numbered editions. An explanation is given in area 7. Alternatively, the information is only given in area 7.

Examples

. — [New ed.]
. — [3e éd.]
. — [Reproduction en fac-similé]
. — [Rev. ed.]
. — [With a new appendix]
. — [Éd. de Grenoble]
. — [2. Aufl.]
. — [Apr. 1995 issue]
. — [Version 1.5]
. — [School ed.]
. — [増訂稿本]
. — [영인판]